Critical Review: In individuals with dementia, is hand feeding an effective and feasible alternative to tube feeding?

Natalie Wilkinson
M.Cl.Sc (SLP) Candidate
Western University: School of Communication Sciences and Disorders

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

*

Introduction

J;?;4)&:*&5*:*#%"'%;55&<;*4;C%"2"'&9:2*5$4@%"?;*)(:)* 9:4* 2;:@*)"* AC49)&"4:2* :4@* 9"''4&)&<;* @;92&4;* KI:?#5"40* !:4@$* L*M"4;50* ,--/N7* 8(;*#%;<:2;49;* %:);5*"A*@;?;4)&:0*'&<;4*)(;*:'&4'*#"#C2:)&"40*=&22* &49%;:5;*="%2@=&@;*)"*O.7.*?&22&"4*#;"#2;*B$*,-P-* KI:?#5"4* ;)* :270* ,--/N7* Q""%* A""@* &4):3;* :4@* ?:24C)%&)&"4*&5*9"??"4*&4*&4@&<&@C:25*=&)(*@;?;4)&:* :4@* ?:$* "99C%* &4*)(;*;:%2$*5):';5*"A*)(;*@&5;:5;* KI:?#5"4*;)*:270*,--/N7*R4*)(;*2:);%*5):';5*"A*)(;* @&5;:5;0*OST*"A*&4@&<&@C:25*=&)(*:@<:49;@*@;?;4)&:* 5CAA;%* A%"?* A;;@&4'* @&AA&9C2)&;5* :4@* U/T* "A* &4@&<&@C:25* @&;* =&)(&4* S* ?"4)(5* KH:45"40* V%5;30* W&22&:?*L*!:%;$0*,-..N7*X;;@&4'*@&AA&9C2)&;5*9"45&5)* "A* A:&2C%;*)"* %;9"'4&F;* A""@0* 2"55* "A* :##;)&);0* @$5#(:'&:0* :4@* :5#&%:)&"4* KI:?#5"4*;)*:270*,--/N7* JC;*)"*)(;5;*4;':)&<;*A:9)"%5*:4@*)(;*(&'(*#%;<:2;49;* "A*A;;@&4'*#%"B2;?5*&4*)(;*2:);%*5):';5*"A*@;?;4)&:0*)CB;*A;;@&4'*&5*:*=&@;2$*C5;@*#%:9)&9;*KI:?#5"4*;)* :270*,--/N7*H"=;<;%0*)(;%;*:%;*5;<;%:2*%&535*:55"9&:);@* =&)(*)CB;*A;;@&4'0*5C9(*:5*&49%;:5;@*&49&@;49;*"A* #%;55C%;* C29;%50*)(;* :99&@;4):2* %;?"<:2* @C%&4'* :'&):)&"4* "%* 9"4AC5&"40*)(;* 4;;@* A"%* %;5)%:&4)50* &??"B&2&)$0* @&:%%(;:0* :4@* A;9:2* &49"4)&4;49;* KJ&B:%)"2"0*--SN7*R4*:@@&)&"40*)(;%;*&5*2&))2;*;?#&%&9:2* ;<&@;49;*)"*5C##"%)*)(;*9C%%;4)*#%:9)&9;*=&)(*4"* &4@&9:)&"4*"A*&?#%"<;?;4)5*&4*?:Y"%*(;:2)(*"C)9"?;5* KW:%%"=*;)*:270*--Z[*I:?#5"4*;)*:270*,--/N7*I"?;* 5)C@&;5*%;#"%)*)(:)*;4)%:2*A;;@&4'*?:$0*&4*A:9)0* &49%;:5;*?"%):2&)$0*?"%B&@&)$*:4@*%;@C9;*\C:2&)$*"A* 2&A;*KI:?#5"4*;)*:270*,--/N7*

!

8(;*@;9&5&"4*)"*:%)&A&9&:22$*A;;@*&4@&<&@C:25*=&)(* @;?;4)&:*&5*(&'(2$*9"4)%"<;%5&:20*:5&4'*?:4$*A&59:20* ;)(&9:2*:4@*?"%:2*9"49;%45*K]C30*!(:40*HC&*L*85;0* ,-.Z[*^&)9(;22*_C9(:4:40*]&))2;(:2;0* L*H:?;20* ,--P[*I:?#5"4*;)*:270*,--/N7*D2);%4:)&<;2$0*(:4@* A;;@&4'*&5*:*?"%;*(C?:4;*:##%":9(*:4@*9:4*:22;<&:);*

(C4';%0*)(&%5)*:4@*&?#%"<;*\C:2&)$*"A*2&A;*:4@* 5"9&:2&F:)&"4*&4*&4@&<&@C:25*=&)(*@;?;4)&:*KJ&_:%)"2"0* ,--S[*W:%%"=*;)*:270*,--ZN7*!C%%;4)2$0*(&'(*\C:2&)$* 5)C@&;5*9"?#:%&4'*"%:2*:4@*)CB;*A;;@&4'*:%;*2&?&);@0* ("=;<;%0*)(;%;*&5*5"?;*;<&@;49;*)"*5C##"%)*(:4@* A;;@&4'* :5* :* <&:B2;* "#)&"4* ="%)($* "A* AC%)(;%* &4<;5)&':)&"4*KH:45"4*;)*:270*,-..N7!

Objectives

8(;*#%&?:%$*"BY;9)&<;*"A*)(&5*#:#;%*&5*)"*9%&)&9:22$* ;<:2C:);*)(;*;>&5)&4'*2&);%:)C%;*"4*(:4@*A;;@&4'*:5*:4* ;AA;9)&<;*:4@*A;:5&B2;*:2);%4:)&<;*)"*)CB;*A;;@&4'*&4* &4@&<&@C:25*=&)(*@;?;4)&:7*8(;*5;9"4@:%$*"BY;9)&<;*&5*)"*;>:?&4;*:4@*:2);%4:)&<;*)"*)CB;*A;;@&4'*)(:)*9:4* (;2#*@&%;9)*9"??;4@&4'*"#)&"45*:4@*:*;<&@;49;E&4A"%?;@* 9:%;*)"*&4@&<&@C:25*=&)(*@;?;4)&:7*

Methods

<u>Search Strategy</u>

G42&4;*@:):B:5;50*5#;9&A&9:22$*QCB^;@0*!R6DH]0* :4@*W""'2;*I9("2:%0*=;%;*C5;@*)"*5;:%9(*A"%*:%)&92;5* %;2:);@*)"*)(;*)"#&9*"A*&4);%;5)7*8(;*A"22"=&4'*);%?5* =;%;*5;:%9(;@`*aKD2);%4:)&<;N*D6J*KCB;*A;;@&4'N* Gb*K;4);%:2*)CB;*A;;@&4'N*D6J*K(:4@*A;;@&4'N*Gb* K"%:2*A;;@&4'N*D6J*K@;?;4)&:N7*

<u>Selection Criteria</u>

&492C@;@*)=" * 4"4E%:4@" ? &F;@* 9" ("%)* 5)C@&;5* K2;<;2* ,B*;<&@;49;N0*)=" *5$5); ? :)&9*%;<&;=5*"A*)(;*2&);%:)C%;* K2;<;2* ,*;<&@;49;N0*:4@*)=" *&4A"% ? :)&"4:2*%;<&;=5*"A*)(;*2&);%:)C%;*K2;<;2*d*;<&@;49;N7**

Results

6"4Eb:4@" ? &F;@*!"("%)*I)C@&;5*

!

6"4E%:4@" ? &F;@*9" ("%)*5)C@&;5*:%;*:##%"#%&:);*=(;4* A:9)"%5*9:44")*B;*%:4@" ? &F;@*:5*@; ? "45)%:);@*&4*)(;* :%)&92;5* %;<&;=;@7* 8(;%;A"%;0*)(;* @:):* 5("C2@* B;* &4);%#%;);@* =&)(*9:C)&"4* '&<;4*)(:)*)(;5;*5)C@&;5*:%;* 5CBY;9)*)"*"B5;%<:)&"4:2*B&:5;5*=(;4*)(;*5)C@$*@;5&'4* @";5*4")*&492C@;*:*eB2&4@f*#%"9;@C%;7**

!

!"#$%&'()*(+*,*#)*'()*(- .%&*/'(0(!1#2&(345678(

;>:?&4;@*:55"9&:)&"45*B;)=;;4*"%:2*A;;@&4'*K4gUSN* :4@*)CB;*A;;@&4'*K4g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

!

I)%;4')(5*&492C@;@*:4*:##%"#%&:);*%;5;:%9(*@;5&'40* ?;)("@50*:4@*=;22*5#;9&A&;@*#:%)&9&#:4)*5;2;9)&"47*8(;* @:):*=:5*:4:2$F;@*=&)(*:##%"#%&:);*5):)&5)&9:2* ?;:5C%;5*)(:)*=;%;*;<&@;49;EB:5;@*:4@*9"?#:%:B2;*)"*#%;<&"C5*%;5;:%9(*5)C@&;57*Q");4)&:2*5;2;9)&"4*B&:5*

&4@&<&@C:250* =&)(* 4"* 5&'4&A&9:4)* @&AA;%;49;5* &4* #%;55C%;*C29;%5*B;)=;;4*)(;*'%"C#5*:4@*4"*5&'4&A&9:4)* &?#%"<;?;4)5*&4*5C%<&<:2*A"22"=&4'*)(;*&45;%)&"4*"A*:* A;;@&4'*)CB;7* 1 ;&'()* ':&4*:4@*4C)%&)&"4*(:@* ?&>;@* %;5C2)50*("=;<;%0*"4;*5)C@$*%;#"%);@*&49%;:5;@*=;&'()* ':&4*A"22"=&4'*)(;*&45;%)&"4*"A*A;;@&4'*)CB;57* 8(&5* #:#;%* 5C##"%);@* #%;<&"C5*A&4@&4'5*)(:)* &4@&9:);* 4"* 92&4&9:2*&?#%"<;?;4)5*=&)(*)(;*C5;*"A*)CB;*A;;@&4'0* ("=;<;%0*&)*&5*:*9"??"42$*C5;@*#%:9)&9;7*

!

R492C5&"4*:4@*;>92C5&"4*9%&);%&:*=;%;*92;:%2$*@;A&4;@* :4@*:*5"C4@*5;:%9(*5)%:);'$*=:5*&?#2;?;4);@*&4* "%@;%*)"*':)(;%*:##%"#%&:);*:%)&92;5*)"*%;<&;=7*8(;* ?;)("@"2"'$*C5;@*=:5*:##%"#%&:);*B:5;@*"4*)(;* 5)C@$*@;5&'47*GA*)(;*.-*5)C@&;5*&492C@;@0*"42$*"4;* =:5*%:4@"?&F;@*:4@*?:4$*"A*)(;*5)C@&;5*(:@*2"=* 2;<;25*"A*;<&@;49;7*R4*:@@&)&"40*:';*"A*#:%)&9&#:4)50* 5;))&4'0*:4@*5):';*"A*@;?;4)&:*@&:'4"5&5*=;%;*4")* 92;:%2$*@;A&4;@7*D*2&?&);@*4C?B;%*"A*5)C@&;5*?;)* 9%&);%&:*A"%*)(&5*%;<&;=0*@;?"45)%:)&4'*)(;*2:93*"A* ;<&@;49;EB:5;@*%;5;:%9(*;>:?&4&4'*92&4&9:2*"C)9"?;5* &4*A;;@&4'*:2);%4:)&<;5*A"%*&4@&<&@C:25*=&)(*@;?;4)&:7* !

8(&5*5)C@$*#%"<&@;5*5C''5)&<;*;<&@;49;*)(:)*)CB;* A;;@&4'*?:$*4")*#%"2"4'*2&A;0*%;@C9;*%:);5*"A* :5#&%:)&"40*#%;55C%;*C29;%50*"%*&?#%"<;*4C)%&)&"4:2* "C)9"?;57**

!

?&#/.#(*$(&:;(3456668(9"4@C9);@*:*5$5);?:)&9*%;<&;=* "A*,d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

:C)("%5*; ? #(:5&F;@*)(;*& ? #"%): 49;* "A* :@<: 49;@*9: %;* #2: 44&4 '*: 4@*: @<: 49;@*@&%;9)&<;5*)"*& ? #%"<;*@;9&5&"4* ? : 3&4 '* %; ' : %@&4 '* "#)& ? : 2* A; ; @&4 '* 9: %;* : 5* @; ? ;4)&:* #%" '%;55;57* _: 5;@* "4*)(;* H"5#&): 2* DC)("%&)$* 'C&@;2&4;5* "4*)%; :) ? ;4)*A"%*)(;*);% ? &4: 22$*&220*] C3*;)*

DiBartolo, M. C. (2006). Careful hand feeding: A reasonable alternative to PEG tube placement in individuals with dementia. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing, 32*(5), 25-33. Retrieved from https://www-lib-uwo-ca.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/cgibin/ezpauthn.cgi?url=http://search.proquest.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/204201343?accountid=15115

Garrow, D., Pride, P., Moran, W., Zapka, J., Amella, E., & Delegge, M. (2007). Feeding alternatives in patients with dementia: Examining the evidence. *Clinical Gastroenterology and Hepatology, 5*(12), 1372-